Questions & Answers
from the
March 9 Budget Workshop

Published on April 3, 2023

Table of Contents

KEY REVENUE UPDATE AND ECONOMIC FORECAST 1

OPERATIONAL STAFFING, COMPENSATION, AND HEALTHCARE 4

FINANCIAL PARTNERS & MSDS 16

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION REQUEST 17

Apendix

FLEXIBLE WORK AND TELEWORK SCHEDULES POLICY 19

Page Intentionally Left Blank

Section 1

KEY REVENUE UPDATE AND ECONOMIC FORECAST

1. When comparing economic analysis trends and reports between Charlotte and the region, is the city's economic analysis consistent with regional analysis? Are there sectors showing any concerning trends?

There have been softening national trends in the technology, financial, and manufacturing sectors, that are also occurring in the local region. Immediate projections forecast a softening labor market, and eventually, a slowing in economic activity which has been accounted for in the city's economic projections for FY 2024. Industry sectors in Professional and Business Services, and Financial Activities are highlighted in the table below. The Charlotte region has total employment concentrated in the two industry sectors at greater levels than compared to North Carolina and across the nation. This larger employment concentration of technology and finance in the Charlotte region highlights a slightly greater volatility to the Charlotte employment environment. While it is unclear how or if layoffs will occur in the region, Charlotte employment has a greater probability of experiencing economic shock.

Employment as a percent of Total, 2022			
Industry Sector	**Charlotte MSA**	**North Carolina**	**United States**
Professional & Business Services	17%	15%	15%
Financial Activities	9%	6%	6%

2. How does the city structure tax tools and collaborate across the region to partner and/or cost-share?

Tax Increment Grant (TIG)

The city has a long history of successful public-private partnerships. A Tax Increment Grant (TIG) is one of the city's best tools available to partner with the private sector to deliver a development that is financially feasible and provides opportunities to further economic development goals of the city and the community. TIGs are not a one size fits all solution. They are best used with developments creating $50 million or more in new taxable value.

These grants are made on a reimbursement basis only and are limited to infrastructure, cultural facilities, and public parking facilities located within the city's incorporated limits. It is important to note that, the grant reimbursement payments are based on new incremental taxes generated within a defined increment area. The TIGs do not lessen taxes that are currently collected. A traditional TIG is a reimbursement payment of 45 or 90 percent of the incremental taxes for a period from 10 to 25 years, depending on the need and benefit derived from the development.

The county usually participates in these partnerships and makes up about two-thirds of the reimbursement payments to the development partner. While none of the current TIGs have a regional contribution, regional collaboration and cost-sharing with another city jurisdiction could occur when a development is located within two or more city limits.

Business Investment Grant (BIG)

Additionally, to help offset the financial commitment associated with a growing business, the City of Charlotte administers the Business Investment Grant (BIG) investment program. The BIG is a reimbursement of incremental ad valorem property taxes paid because of a company's investment. The grant can range from 50 to 90 percent reimbursement with term periods between three and ten years. Requirements include a certain number of jobs created that pay 100 to 125 percent of the average annual wage for the Charlotte Metropolitan Statistical Area (MSA) or the average annual wage for the standard occupation classification in the Charlotte MSA. The percentage of reimbursement varies due to factors that include whether a company has current operations in Charlotte and if the business is within a targeted industry.

The city's BIG may also be complemented with a BIG from Mecklenburg County. As a Tier 3 county, designated by the Department of Commerce, the city recognizes that companies are only eligible for the State's Job Development Investment Grant (JDIG) program if they are offered a local incentive. The JDIG is a performance-based, discretionary program that provides cash grants from the state directly to a company when the company creates jobs and invests in the state. While this is not a cost-share opportunity, the policy demonstrates the collaboration required at the state and local levels to attract a business recruitment project.

3. What is the true cost of growth to the city?

In 2021 Economic and Planning Systems, Inc. produced a fiscal impact analysis related to the net cost of growth in the city. This analysis was created in conjunction with the Charlotte Future 2040 Comprehensive Plan. The analysis used historical city revenue and expenditures to evaluate the cost on city services of new growth within the city. The intention was to help understand the potential impact of growth over 20 years both "business as usual" and under the "Future Place Types" scenario described in the plan.

The analysis concluded that transportation and fire services are the General Fund expenditures that are most impacted by land use patterns and generate the major differences in net fiscal impact of differing growth patterns. The study estimated that every 1,000 people that are added creates up to $17,000 per year of street maintenance costs alone. Additionally, Charlotte Fire Department spends $102,000 for every 1,000 new residents served, or a cost of around $102/person. Density is advantageous for both transportation and fire, with the cost per person decreasing based on density.

Other main services such as Police and Sanitation have experienced costs that are less dependent on land use patterns, and more dependent on the peak number of people served. Historical data indicates that as of the most recent fiscal year of the study, it costs CMPD $255 for every additional person served. Likewise, it costs Solid Waste services $62 for every additional person served.

The study concluded that increased revenue from growth is likely to help offset the increased costs of basic city services that account for the growth. City General Fund Property tax revenue from new units ranged from between $450 to $1,000 for every residential unit. New General Fund sales tax revenue from residents is estimated at $94 per person. Additional revenues project to add an additional $47 per person.

One key finding from the evaluation is that although revenue from growth helps offset the cost of key city services, it falls short in two key categories: mobility and community amenities. This includes the cost of new roads and walkability that may be needed due to indirect impacts. Additionally, some amenities such as green infrastructure and affordable housing are not supported by revenue from growth. Finally, this study was conducted in 2021, prior to the biggest impacts from inflation on city services. Further analysis may indicate changes in the results, as the city's main revenue source (property tax) does not experience inflation growth due to revaluation.

The full report can be referenced on-line at: https://charlotteudo.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/07/CLT-UDO-Economic-Analysis-2nd-Draft-Update.pdf.

Section 2

OPERATIONAL STAFFING, COMPENSATION, AND HEALTHCARE

1. **How would changing legislation affect staffing levels if the civilianization of some sworn duties are redirected toward non-sworn personnel?**

   The city's SAFE Charlotte efforts resulted in recommendation to civilianize certain clerical and administrative functions formerly performed by sworn officers. 37 sworn positions were civilianized during the FY23 budget process, allowing many sworn officers to convert to other duties more directly related to their training in public safety.

   City Council's 2023 State Legislative Agenda supports legislation that would allow CMPD to deploy trained civilians to respond to low-risk, non-emergency calls for service. Investigation of minor traffic accidents involving no injuries or citations has been identified as an especially impactful duty that could be converted to trained civilians. Local acts of the state legislature have allowed Fayetteville and Wilmington to employ trained civilians for this purpose since 2006 and 2007, respectively. In the past two years, Wilmington's civilian traffic response has handled approximately 2,000 accidents per year, which accounts for nearly 30 percent of all accidents in the city. CMPD responded to approximately 41,300 traffic calls for service during 2022. Of these calls for service, approximately 7,600 (18.5%) were for minor, non-roadway, property damage accidents. The average service time for these non-emergency accidents was approximately 1.5 hours, meaning a civilianization of this response could free up to 11,000 hours per year of sworn officer time. This is equivalent to up to five officers that could be assigned to other priorities within the department. This figure is an estimate is based on several assumptions and variation in any of these assumptions will affect the accuracy of the estimate. The actual amount of sworn officer time that could be reprioritized through civilianization will depend on the specific language of any legislation that may pass and the volume and type of traffic accidents that occur each year.

2. **What is needed to enhance hiring efforts to meet the rates of Police resignations and retirements? What factors are driving Police vacancies? At what point in the recruitment process are minority candidates dropping out of the process? What percentage of police applicants make it to the final stage of hiring?**

   The city has recently implemented strategies to improve recruitment and retention for sworn personnel in Police through strategies and initiatives such as:

   - A $7,500 signing bonus for new recruits and lateral transfers
   - A 9 percent increase to starting pay in FY 2023 (currently $51,465) and with 4-year degree
   - 5 percent pay incentive for military service to match current Associates degree pay
   - A 12.5 percent increase to the top of the officer step plan between FY 2019 and FY 2021
   - A 10 percent increase to the top of the sergeant step plan between FY 2020 and FY 2021
   - Streamlining the application process to remove duplicate questions and completion time

- Continued work with the Public Safety Pay Plan committee to explore targeted changes to the step plan for officers and sergeants

Recognized factors that attract Police Officers to serve at other municipalities that the City of Charlotte has programmed at smaller scales or not at all are take-home vehicles, retiree healthcare, and longevity pay. A key career pathing detail for Police Officers in the State of North Carolina is the ability to retire after 20 years of service which contributes to a quicker rotation of career pathing for sworn employees compared to general employees.

When reviewing recruitment data, the top disqualifying causes for minority candidates within the Police recruitment process include:

1. Applicant does not meet minimum qualifications
2. No show for written exam
3. Failure to respond to participate in the process
4. Disqualified due to driving history
5. Disqualified due to criminal history

On average approximately 5.5 percent of the candidates who enter the hiring process phase become sworn officers. See the table below for additional information about the progression of applicants to graduates for Police.

		2017	**2018**	**2019**	**2020**	**2021**	**2022**
Lateral Transfers	*Applications*	246	232	171	331	267	193
	Academy Starts	17	51	34	22	31	19
	Percent of Applicants Started Academy	**6.9%**	**22.0%**	**19.9%**	**6.6%**	**11.6%**	**9.8%**
	Academy Graduates	17	51	33	22	31	19
	Percent of Applicants Graduated Academy	**6.9%**	**22.0%**	**19.3%**	**6.6%**	**11.6%**	**9.8%**
Traditional Recruits	*Applications*	2278	2923	2868	3208	2120	1794
	Academy Starts	110	105	121	132	104	132
	Percent of Applicants Started Academy	**4.8%**	**3.6%**	**4.2%**	**4.1%**	**4.9%**	**7.4%**
	Academy Graduates	90	83	88	99	87	91
	Percent of Applicants Graduated Academy	**4.0%**	**2.8%**	**3.1%**	**3.1%**	**4.1%**	**5.1%**
Total	*Applications*	2524	3155	3039	3539	2387	1987
	Academy Starts	127	156	155	154	135	151
	Percent of Applicants Started Academy	**5.0%**	**4.9%**	**5.1%**	**4.4%**	**5.7%**	**7.6%**
	Academy Graduates	107	134	121	121	118	110
	Percent of Applicants Graduated Academy	**4.2%**	**4.2%**	**4.0%**	**3.4%**	**4.9%**	**5.5%**

Prior to 2020, resignations and retirements of sworn police officers were approximately level with the number of new officers CMPD was able to recruit and train each year. In recent years, however, external factors have created recruitment and retention challenges across the organization. Both retirements and resignations have increased over the past few years, while recruitment levels have slightly dropped. This is a nationwide trend not unique to Charlotte. As of March 2023, there are 327 sworn officer vacancies, resulting in a sworn officer vacancy rate of 19.4 percent.

The SAFE Charlotte recommendation to civilianize clerical and administrative functions formerly performed by sworn officers has helped to mitigate this decline in sworn staffing, as many of these officers were able to return to patrol duties. 37 sworn positions were civilianized in the FY 2023 budget process. Through this and other staffing strategies, CMPD has maintained consistent service levels despite recent staffing challenges.

The future of sworn police staffing is primarily dependent on how resignation and hiring levels change over the next few years. Based on the longevity and age of CMPD's current officers, annual retirements are projected to decline from approximately 80 per year to approximately 59 per year beginning in 2024. Despite this drop in retirements, sworn staffing levels are projected to continue to decline unless resignations and hiring rates improve. The figures below show forecasted sworn staffing relative to 2022 based on several recruitment and resignation scenarios.




Improved hiring; current level of resignations
0
-10
-20
-30
-40
-50
-60
-70
-80
2022
2023
2024
2025
2026
Sworn Staffing (relative to 2022)
Calendar Year


Current level of hiring; improved resignation levels
0
-5
-10
-15
-20
-25
-30
-35
2022
2023
2024
2025
2026
Sworn Staffing (relative to 2022)
Calendar Year


Improved hiring and resignation levels
25
20
15
10
5
0
-5
-10
-15
-20
-25
2022
2023
2024
2025
2026
Sworn Staffing (relative to 2022)
Calendar Year

3. Has there been any consideration in contracting city services to the private sector?

The city does weigh service options and benchmark against privately provided services. An example included is within the city's Solid Waste Services.

The city's Solid Waste Services Department contracts for the weekly collection of refuse, recyclables, bulky waste, and seasonal collection of natural Christmas trees for approximately 145,000 multifamily residential units and 110 public facilities. Solid Waste Services has also contracted with private haulers for curbside residential recycling collection since 2010, with a brief exception during a transition period from one hauler to another. Outsourcing of recycling services includes bi-weekly collection and transportation of all recyclables generated by customers and placed in city-provided containers to designated processing facilities.

The city provides several residential and community services in-house such as curbside garbage, yard waste, bulky item collection, rights-of-way cleaning, street sweeping, and dead animal collection. Many factors are considered when determining the value in Solid Waste Services providing a service with city staff compared to contracting a service to an outside source. For example, private haulers do not typically provide stand-alone residential yard waste collection services that are needed to service residences. There are many variables, including volume and workload, that are seasonally impacted due to weather events which also create inconsistent workload challenges that are better suited for in-house management of projecting capacity and specific service delivery needs.

In addition, services provided directly to the public support services, such as fleet management for Solid Waste Services, are also considered.

The Fleet Management Division within the General Services Department maintains the City of Charlotte's and Mecklenburg County's stock of equipment and commercial motor vehicles, including cars, vans, trucks, and specialty vehicles such as fire and garbage trucks. Fleet technicians and other staff provide skilled services, including preventive maintenance and equipment repair, fleet information and usage analysis, parts and inventory compliance and warranty management. Fleet Management's goal is to provide safe and reliable maintenance and repair at the best value for more than 7,000 city and county vehicles and pieces of equipment. Fleet Management operates at six major maintenance facilities and one commission and decommission facility.

Fleet Management has explored contracting out the maintenance and repair services for heavy fleet vehicles (vehicles greater than 10,000 pounds) for Solid Waste Services. The cost benefit analysis of privatizing these services that included consideration of parts, labor and overhead, found that the private sector would cost approximately $2 million more annually than the city's current in-house services cost.

4. Has the city reviewed incentive opportunities to retain employees that have completed training and workforce development programs?

The city's Human Resources Department occasionally reviews public sector best practices and legal authority to provide incentive opportunities to employees that have completed city supported training and workforce development programs. The City Attorney's Office provided guidance for this research

topic and an opinion to refrain from creating an implied employment contract was determined to be in the best interest for the city.

The city incentivizes staff to stay employed with the city through access to additional trainings and certifications that help promote career lattices and upward mobility within the city. The city has not experienced high turnover of employees who elect to participate in job training and/or education assistance programs. However, in a high demand labor market, the city does encounter city employees being highly recruited by local private sector businesses. Highly recruited jobs within the city include Solid Waste Services Equipment Operator, Utility Technicians, and Heavy-Duty Equipment Operators (i.e., large trucks and heavy-duty construction equipment). The city's retention strategy is to maximize other perks and benefits, such as internal growth via internal job training, workforce development and career pathing for hard to fill jobs. The city also works to maintain a comprehensive benefit offering and is a member of the NC State Retirement plan that offers service retirement pension benefits.

5. Are any benefits underutilized from the city's benefits package?

The city provides a comprehensive benefits package with a variety of benefits that employees can choose to meet their unique needs each calendar year. The city's portfolio may develop year-to-year and offer different and sometimes better tailored benefits options as employee feedback is gathered.

The city's health plan and dental plan have a 93 percent participation rate. Of employees utilizing health services, 94 percent of employees routinely utilize the Marathon Health Clinic for healthcare, physical therapy, and health coaching services.

City paid benefits such as the Employee Assistance Program (EAP), Health Advocate, Short-Term Disability and Basic Life Insurance are provided to 100 percent of regular employees. Of these benefits, the EAP services have the lowest utilization rate. The national utilization rate of EAP services ranges between eight and nine percent, while the City of Charlotte's EAP program utilization is near 13 percent. The City of Charlotte generally uses the EAP services for department counseling when tragic events occur that impact the work group. On-site counseling services are provided by request and have yielded high utilization.

Employees also have access to voluntary benefits, which include vision, flexible spending accounts, supplemental life insurance, whole life insurance, accident, critical illness, long term disability, home/auto/pet insurance. Costs of these supplemental benefits are paid for by the employee. Participation in these plans range from 25-75 percent participation based on the plan.

Human Resources continuously seeks feedback from employees to tailor offerings to the needs. For example, prior to 2021, the Education Assistance program was being underutilized in many departments. In FY 2023, the city reviewed the Education Assistance Policy to identify opportunities to better meet the needs of city employees. The previous policy required employees to pay for tuition upfront and was based on reimbursement following the successful completion of coursework. The enhanced policy offers three options to employees to access education: a tuition free – city sponsored prepayment program for Associates degrees, tuition reimbursement, and free access to LinkedIn Learning.

6. Are there any opportunities to transition city services toward becoming fee-based?

The city supports essential city services that benefit and are available to everyone in the community (e.g., police, fire, street maintenance) with tax dollars (e.g., public goods). These same services also represent, in dollar terms, most of the General Fund budget, leaving fewer opportunities, in dollar terms, to generate new revenue from the creation of new fees.

As part of the budget process, each year the city reviews its fees to ensure the costs associated with the respective services continue to be recovered by the fees. The review also includes feedback from departments as to additional services that may be appropriate for inclusion as fee based.

For services that largely or solely benefit individuals specifically using the service, and where the city is willing and able (legally and without much administrative burden) to exclude customers for non-payment, the city has typically implemented user fees to recover the costs associated with delivering the service.

For the city, this most often occurs in services related to reviewing land development plans and construction. It is also important to note that, legally in North Carolina for some fees (e.g., regulatory fees) cities cannot subsidize taxpayers by imposing fees which recover more revenue that the costs to the city of providing the service. There are other considerations, beyond balancing the budget and/or minimizing the tax burden, in deciding whether to charge a fee, including:

- The cost of collection
- Whether imposing a fee that recovers all or some costs would pose a hardship on specific users
- The impact of fees on the city's other policy goals
- Whether the use of the service is voluntary and/or the user can decide how much to use and when
- The need to limit demand
- The impact a fee would have on regulatory compliance or discouraging the use of a service

The following table illustrates some of the new fees adopted by City Council since FY 2020 and the revenue generated by each in FY 2022.

General Fund Fee	Fiscal Year Began	Annual Revenue
Right-of-Way Pre-Submittal Meeting Fee (CDOT)	FY 2020	$9,500
Animal Surrender Fee (CMPD)	FY 2021	$17,720
Commercial Plan Revision (CDOT)	FY 2022	$21,850
Subdivision Plan Revision (CDOT)	FY 2022	$25,245
Subdivision Sketch Review (CDOT)	FY 2022	$46,560
Festival Application Fee (CDOT)	FY 2022	$4,800
Right-of-Way Use Permits (<30 days) (CDOT)	FY 2023	$114,320
Historic District After-the-Fact Administrative Approval (PD&D)	FY 2023	$7,700
Entombment Fee (Gen. Services)	FY 2023	$2,000
Sale of Family Estate Area (25x25 feet area) (Gen. Services)	FY 2023	$50,000

As services change over time the city will to evaluate opportunities where it would be appropriate to impose fees for city services.

7. What are the findings from the city's study on promotions and hiring?

The city is utilizing the services of Management Partners to provide a comprehensive review of the recruitment and promotional processes within the city. City processes are compared to industry best practices. HR will be provided with recommendations of methods and practices to improve efficiency and effectiveness. A key component that enhanced the scope of work included diversity, equity, inclusion, and belonging practices to further develop the city's comprehensive recruitment and promotional processes. This study will be finalized in May 2023.

8. What is the city's remote work policy?

The City of Charlotte last reviewed the Flexible Work and Telework Schedules policy in 2021 to meet the changing work environment and virtual option needs associated with the COVID-19 pandemic. The city's policy supports telework and/or flexible work schedules based on reasonable applicability for certain job duties that have the capability of being performed in a remote environment. With management approval employees may telework and/or organize a flexible work schedule during part of the work week but may not do so for 100 percent of their work hours. The arrangement of an alternative work schedule is based on job duties and roles within the work team. Generally, a flexible work schedule means performing job duties during alternative times of the day and days of the week while still meeting the 40-hour work week requirement. Telework options generally allow an employee to have a weekly rotation of on-site and off-site workdays. The city routinely considers ways to optimize work-life balance while maintaining accountability of public resources with consistent service levels. A copy of the city's Flexible Work and Telework Schedules policy is attached.

9. Are there compensation differences between city salaries and the private sector?

The Department of Human Resource's Compensation and Classification team routinely benchmarks compensation for all city classifications against municipalities across the nation and selective private sector jobs. Current trends show that there is typically an average of 8-10 percent higher pay for applicable positions within the private sector. In addition, research from the National Institute on Retirement Security from May 2020 showed employees of state & local government earn an average of 11-12 percent less, than comparable private sector employees.

The data below was gathered from Charlotte employees who recently left the city for private sector jobs.

Salaried Staff Turnover to Private Sector

- Procurement- Starting salary on average 33 percent higher
- Sustainability- Starting salary on average 49 percent higher
- Engineering- Starting salary on average 35 percent higher
- Communications- Starting salary on average 75 percent higher

Hourly Staff Turnover to Private Sector

- Senior Heavy Diesel Technicians – Starting salary on average 33 percent higher

- Senior HVAC Technicians – Starting salary on average 18 percent higher
- Water Service Technicians- Starting salary on average 7 percent higher
- Sanitation Equipment Operator - Starting salary on average 13 percent higher

10. How is the city meeting small business and MWSBE goals?

The Charlotte Business INClusion (CBI) Program seeks to enhance the competitiveness and participation of small, minority, and women owned firms in city contracting and to promote economic growth and development in the City of Charlotte. Preliminary MWSBE spend goals established in FY 2022 are projected to be met in FY 2023. Data shows that city expenditures have increased with the city's MWSBE vendors.

CBI is expanding its capacity by creating initiatives to establish programs and expand current services for the city's certified MWSBEs. The FY 2023 Adopted Budget included $1.3 million to enhance MWSBE capacity.

CBI established a MWSBE bonding program to elevate CBI's reach within the local business community. By creating a Surety Bonding Program, this resource will help remove barriers that impede MWSBEs' ability to grow and bid as prime contractors or take on larger subcontracts. A request for council action to establish the consultant to administer the construction bonding program will be included within an upcoming Council business meeting.

CBI will also be launching a Capital Access Program that addresses the most frequent barriers experienced in seeking contracting opportunities and capacity building for its certified MWSBEs. CBI's Capital Access Program will create loans for MWSBEs turned down by traditional banks due to a lack of cash reserves or no established relationship with a bank. Funding has allowed CBI to develop a framework that implements a revolving loan pool through a banking partner to improve capital access as local enterprises seek to grow businesses. CBI currently has nine budgeted positions.

11. Please provide a progress update on staffing the city's bridging the digital divide initiative?

Phase 1 of the city's Access Charlotte Digital Inclusion initiative was accomplished by using existing city staff and by collaborating with outside partners. Phase 1 was primarily funded with funds from the CARES Act. During this phase, we established the foundation for a repeatable process and an eco-system of partners that carried us into Phase 2.

Phase 2, which the city is currently executing, is funded with funds from the American Rescue Plan Act. Staffing costs, therefore, are supported by ARPA grant funds (and not the General Fund) through at least December 31, 2024. Staffing consists of the following:

1. City 311 agents receive and triage residents' calls concerning technology support for city sponsored internet
2. The city has funded two Digital Navigators services are provided through a contract with Queens University. Queens University will provide training to residents on:
    - basic digital skills, and

- signing up for the Affordable Connectivity Program (APC), offering $30 towards home internet. The city's contribution is to assist 10,000 residents with accessing the ACP.

3. Using ARPA allocated funds, the city hired two dedicated resources for the Digital Inclusion work (Program Manager & Program Coordinator)

4. Through the most recent contract with Charter/Spectrum the city will be turning on approximately 7900 households with direct home internet. Residents will have access to the Spectrum support services, for connectivity issues, just like every other customer.

5. The city will be creating a Learn to Earn program that will enable residents to develop technical job skills, while earning technology items like a tablet, laptop, or other item.

As City Council has designated the digital divide as one of its key initiatives, the city has ensured that the time of some existing staff resources will also be partially allocated to support this initiative and to ensure its success.

12. Provide Code Enforcement staffing levels and calls for service, highlighting Corridor of Opportunity geographies.

The Code Enforcement Division of Housing & Neighborhood Services works to improve and maintain Charlotte's communities through standards of safe and healthy housing across the city. Code Enforcement addresses violations of city ordinances related to nuisance, housing, graffiti, zoning, and non-residential building code (commercial). Code Enforcement has 41 inspectors that cover 106 defined geographies throughout the City of Charlotte and Mecklenburg County. There are 47 of these areas that intersect the Corridors of Opportunity and Areas of Influence (Corridors) and there are 24 inspectors assigned to work in these specific areas.

Code Enforcement Workload in Corridors

From FY 2020 through December 31, 2022 (three and a half years), Code inspectors investigated nearly 67,000 potential violations within the Corridors of Opportunity. While there is variation by year and by Corridor, overall, the work in the Corridors comprised between two and ten percent of Code Enforcement's total workload throughout this period.

Table 1 illustrates the total number of investigations in each Corridor. Trends to note:

- Complaints increased in FY 2021 while residents were spending more time at home during the height of the COVID-19 pandemic.
- Overall investigations increased in FY 2021 in the Beatties Ford/Rozzelles Ferry Corridor due to significant proactive canvassing in these neighborhoods by Code inspectors, in partnership with the Corridors team. Numbers subsequently declined in FY 2022 because Code Enforcement had successfully worked with residents and property owners to bring violations into compliance.
- Across all Corridors, due to increased outreach, education, and canvassing FY 2023 investigations are on pace to exceed FY 2022 totals.

Table 1.

Corridor	FY 2020	FY 2021	FY 2022	FY 2023 through 12/31/22	Total
Beatties Ford/Rozzelles Ferry	2,996	3,561	2,859	1,341	10,757
Central/Albemarle	5,427	6,224	4,611	3,002	19,264
Freedom Drive/Wilkinson	4,770	3,766	3,419	1,618	13,573
Graham Street/North Tryon	1,480	1,739	1,571	1,092	5,882
Sugar Creek/I-85	2,999	3,525	3,494	1,861	11,879
West Boulevard	1,744	1,496	1,516	834	5,590
Total	**19,416**	**20,311**	**17,470**	**9,748**	**66,945**

Table 2 illustrates the total number of investigations by case type across all six Corridors. To note:

- Nuisance cases, which include common conditions such as tall weeds and grass, abandoned and junk vehicles, and neglect of premise, are the largest workload for Code Enforcement, comprising 87 percent of total investigations across all Corridors.

Table 2.

Case Type	FY 2020	FY 2021	FY 2022	FY 2023 through 12/31/22	Total
Commercial	21	38	14	11	84
Graffiti			391	165	556
Housing	823	886	780	282	2,771
Nuisance	17,031	17,809	14,887	8,452	58,179
Zoning	1,541	1,578	1,398	838	5,355
Total	**19,416**	**20,311**	**17,470**	**9,748**	**66,945**

Performance Goals

Cases are referred to Code Enforcement through complaints, field observations, petition, fire, police, and public agency referral. Code has a goal of proactively identifying 55 percent of the total investigations (field observations). In this way, Code inspectors can identify violations and work with owners to bring them into compliance before they become resident complaints. Across the Corridors, Code Enforcement is exceeding that goal, ranging from 59 percent to 72 percent proactive investigations by Corridor (64 percent overall).

Code Enforcement has several performance goals to ensure timely response and compliance for various case types. Code is currently meeting performance goals (across the jurisdiction and within Corridors) related to facilitating compliance but is one day off from meeting response time goals for the initial investigations of nuisance complaints. Within Corridors over this time, 91 percent of complaints were inspected within four days.

Table 3.

Case Compliance Goals		**Corridors**
Nuisance	90% of cases closed within 30 days	95%
Zoning	90% of cases closed within 90 days	92%
Housing	75% of cases closed within 180 days	78%
Initial Investigation Goals		
Nuisance	90% of complaints inspected within 3 days	83%

The city, and Code Enforcement specifically, experienced significant staffing and operational challenges during the pandemic that continue to impact ability to meet all performance goals. Out of 41 inspector positions, there are currently two vacancies, and nine inspectors who are still in training.

Community Engagement and Proactive Problem-Solving

The city's code inspectors are out in the community every day, proactively canvassing neighborhoods to identify and address violations before they become complaints. Code Enforcement partners with neighborhood organizations to conduct outreach efforts such as door-to-door neighborhood "knock and talks" that help educate residents about how to keep the community healthy, clean, and safe.

Within the Corridors, Code has led educational sweeps along the Beatties Ford/Rozzelles Ferry and West Boulevard Corridors and participated in the Community Visualization Surveys for the Staying in Place pilot program in Winterfield, Hidden Valley, and Washington Heights. Code Enforcement also collaborates with Solid Waste Services, Keep Charlotte Beautiful, Charlotte Department of Transportation, Police, and other partners to address challenging quality of life issues related to litter, illegal parking, and tractor-trailers.

13. Are there opportunities to restructure compensation increases to be contingent on performance for Council's direct reports?

A municipality's decision to provide a discretionary or nondiscretionary performance bonus is specific to the needs of the organization. The City of Charlotte has the authority to determine how and when appointed positions - the City Manager, City Attorney, and City Clerk are compensated. The city can provide performance bonuses and other pay increases and determine how to best align any of these with performance. At the desire of city council, a discretionary bonus could be determined by city council based on an overall assessment of performance. A non-discretionary bonus would be determined based on the achievement of specific objectives.

The city's Human Resources Department surveyed national peer cities and North Carolina large and regional municipalities for compensation data of appointed positions. The current and historical survey results indicate these municipalities do not utilize a prescribed milestone achievement bonus program for these positions.

The Budget, Governance, and Intergovernmental Relations Committee is currently reviewing an active referral on Appointed Positions Personnel Evaluations. Outcomes of the committee charge will highlight recommendations specific to how to effectively evaluate appointed positions.

Section 3

FINANCIAL PARTNERS & MSDS

Provide additional information on DreamKey and Crisis Assistance FY 2024 Financial Partner requests.

DreamKey

Dream Key Partners (DKP) is a nonprofit agency that provides affordable housing by administering comprehensive services that include pre- and post-homeownership counseling, mortgage delinquency prevention and default counseling, sale of houses, affordable mortgages, construction, and renovation of for sale and rental housing.

The total FY 2024 Dream Key Partners funding request of $1.86 million includes $1.47 million in federal Community Development Block Grant funding and $390,000 from the locally funded Innovative Housing Fund. FY 2023 funding for the organization for affordable housing the specific initiatives totaled $1.69 million. For the House Charlotte program DKP is also requesting $231,000 in FY 2024, the same funding level as FY 2023. The House Charlotte program enables down payment and mortgage assistance to low-to-moderate income eligible homebuyers.

Crisis Assistance

The mission of Crisis Assistance Ministry is to provide assistance and advocacy for people in financial crisis, helping them move toward self-sufficiency. Crisis Assistance Ministry provides families with assistance meeting life's basic needs (housing, utilities, clothing, furniture), preventing a financial crisis from developing into a downward spiral towards homelessness. City funding is used towards Crisis Assistance's City Energy Assistance (CEA) program that provides direct payments to utility companies on behalf of low-income households residing in Charlotte who are unable to pay their utility bills during times of financial crisis, and for the Emergency Rental Assistance program

In FY 2023, Crisis Assistance was awarded $425,000 in funding. The request for FY 2024 totals $550,000 and includes $175,000 for utility assistance and $375,000 for rental assistance. The increase from FY 2023 to FY 2024 is intended to help offset the impact of increasing rental rates in the city.

Section 4

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION REQUEST

1. What would it take to make the Mayor's Youth Employment Program (MYEP) year around?

The current program is a six-week program geared to provide opportunities while youth are on break from school.

MYEP participants explore careers, hone skills, and gain exposure to models of professionalism, creating pathways to attainable career goals. MYEP seeks to build partnerships with host employers in the private, public, and non-profit sectors of Charlotte's economy who can provide one-of-a-kind career experiences for MYEP participants. Businesses provide career experiences that help youth develop career goals, stay in school, achieve academically, and enhance social skills that enable them to succeed in life. Students connect to the world of work which enables businesses and communities to know the needs and successes of the students and schools.

MYEP participants are high school age youth seeking career exploration or employment opportunities. Participants include youth aged 16 years and older that are associated with various community partners, charter schools, home school, e-learning and others. Charlotte Mecklenburg-School students work with the Career Development Coordinator contact at their school regarding participating in the MYEP.

An expansion opportunity that supports a year-round approach to leveraging MYEP efforts is further developing the Job and Career Readiness Training (JCRT) program. This program is offered each fall to prepare youth for work-based learning opportunities through provision of employer requested skills. JCRT is available to all Charlotte youth ages 16-24, and participation is a prerequisite for Mayor's Youth Employment Program (MYEP) paid summer internships.

2. Please provide an update on 911 telecommunications staffing and performance.

During FY 2023 budget planning, city staff informed council of systemic retention challenges in General Hourly employees driven largely by effects of the COVID-19 pandemic. These retention challenges affected 911 telecommunications, with call-answering and dispatch times hitting a low in October 2022. At this time, staffing was 106 of 125.5 budgeted positions and 53.4 percent of calls were answered within 10 seconds, well short of the city's goal of 90 percent.

The city implemented several measures in the FY23 Budget and beyond to combat these challenges, such as:

- An 8 percent pay increase for hourly employees
- A 2.5 percent shift differential incentive for employees in job assignments with multiple shifts who are permanently assigned to second or third shifts
- Creation of Telecommunicator Senior job classification to provide further advancement opportunities within the telecommunicator career path
- Use of temporary contracted call takers

In addition to the above financial enhancements, CMPD implemented the following changes:

- Shifted certain non-emergency calls to 311 for processing
- Implementation of 911 overflow queue allowing calls to overflow to CFD and MEDIC
- Partnered with the Academy's Recruiting Division to recruit call-takers on sworn recruitment trips
- Partnered with Public Affairs on media relations and social media messaging efforts
- Partnered with Human Resources to optimize pre-employment testing and interview processes
- Focused on retention efforts to include employee wellness with an on-site life coach and peer support
- Improved leadership and focused supervision such as shift staffing, hourly call answer times, and data review optimization

A telecommunications update was provided at the March 9 Budget Workshop. This update included the current staffing and call-answering metrics, which are:

- Improved retention—there has been a turnover of just four employees since October 2022. Two of these employees assumed other roles within the city, with one becoming a police recruit and another taking a separate civilian position within CMPD
- Improvement in staffing, with 119 of 125.5 budget positions filled
    - 18 candidates are currently in the hiring process and could be hired by June 2023
- Steady improvements in call-answering time, with:
    - 63.9 percent of calls answered within 10 seconds during November 2022,
    - 64.3 percent during December 2022,
    - 83.1 percent during January 2023, and
    - 84.6 percent during February 2023.

APPENDIX

Flexible Work and Telework Schedules Policy

APPENDIX: FLEXIBLE WORK AND TELEWORK SCHEDULES POLICY

CHARLOTTE.

Subject/Title
Flexible Work and Telework Schedules

Date Effective
July 1, 2021

Revision Date Effective
July 1, 2021

Code Number
HR 17

City Manager

Human Resources
Responsible Department

OBJECTIVE

The City of Charlotte is committed to promoting an environment in which our community and employees can thrive. We seek to acquire and retain a diverse, high talent and highly productive workforce and value work-life balance. As part of that vision, we embrace a culture that embodies work flexibility to include teleworking and/or flexible work schedules, while maintaining the City of Charlotte's commitment to excellence in public service to the communities we serve.

Benefits of flexible work, inclusive of teleworking:

- Stimulates work and family wellness and balance
- Reduced traffic congestion
- Environmental benefits due to reduced air pollution
- Improves space utilization for city offices and workspaces

SCOPE

City departments are to identify methods of implementation that meet the service and operational needs of the department. The degree to which it is applied will vary based upon job type and service delivery requirements of the department.

There are certain jobs that do not lend themselves to flexible schedules and/or telework, therefore this policy is implemented based on reasonable applicability and is limited to the jobs that can be performed from a remote location. In general, 25% of city employees hold jobs that can be performed in a telework environment.

DEFINITION

Flexible Schedule:

- Flexible start times and end times and/or flexible work schedules.

Telework:

- Employee works at a city worksite and away from a city worksite on a periodic or ad hoc basis. The employee is expected to report to a designated city work site during some portion of the work week or month.

POLICY

DEPARTMENTS:

Departments are encouraged to explore opportunities to provide flexible work arrangements to include flexible work schedules and/or teleworking opportunities for positions that can successfully be performed in a decentralized, flexible and/or telework manner. However, departments are not authorized to establish a remote employee (100% teleworking) position.

Departments retain the ability to provide employees teleworking options based on business needs and can require staff to report onsite as needed.

Each department will determine the frequency of the telework structure. Implementation method can vary by department due to the unique functions performed within the department's area of responsibility.

EMPLOYEES:

With management approval, employees can telework during part of the workweek.

While teleworking, employees are expected to be available during the department's designated core hours and work their regular hours to be able to convene with management and/or work teams as needed, unless a different arrangement has been made with the supervisor.

Employees allowed to participate in a telework program are expected to remain available and within a reasonable commute time to a designated City worksite as needed by your department. Changes to hours of work or site location must be pre-approved by the supervisor.

Employees are expected to adhere to the department's established procedures for reporting leave of absences when approved to telework. Unless traveling for business, teleworking employees are expected to remain available to report to a city worksite as needed. While teleworking, an employee shall not conduct work for another employer during their standard or normal work schedule.

The employee is expected and responsible to equip their telework space. Example: provide their own chair, desk and basic office supplies and have access to the internet. Employees who are unable to meet this expectation are to remain reporting to a City work site that is equipped.

Upon separation of employment, employees are required to return all city issued equipment.

PROCEDURE

For applicable jobs, departments are to design a Flexible Work plan or identify a Telework option that meets their business needs while also embracing the desired culture of flexible work arrangements.

Approximately 25% of city employees hold jobs that can be performed in a telework environment. Departments are expected to design a work arrangement that includes telework options based on job duties and roles.

Flexible Schedule Options:

- Flexible shift times.
  - Example: Start times between 6:00 a.m. to 10:00 a.m.
  - This is only an example. Departments remain able provide flexible start and stop times based on their unique operations.
- Flexible work times:
  - Some jobs are not "shift centric" and can be performed during different hours of the day. For applicable jobs or duties, departments are encouraged to provide a flexible work schedule that is conducive for the employee and the department as long as project deadlines are met.
- Any form of flexible work schedule options, within reason, that can meet department business need. Reasonableness as determined by the manager.

Telework Options:

- 1-4 days per week telework or
- Weekly rotation of onsite-offsite

Technology Equipment and Tools:
Departments and employees are strongly encouraged to explore and use the many technology enhancements that are provided by the City and are designed to virtually connect staff who are remote from one another. Example: Microsoft Teams offer *several* features that provide for collaboration of work by multiple people without having the people co-located. Adapting new learning and behavior is integral to the process and success of "how to telework effectively".

Other equipment and tools:

- City of Charlotte laptop and laptop bag.
- City of Charlotte cellular phone
  - Determined by the department. Some employees might not be assigned a cellular phone.
- Departments are authorized to issue other types of work equipment based on job and duties of the employee.